



Rika Pratiwi <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

MS #1185: Submission received for Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development

1 message

Editors of Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development <editors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

Tue, Dec 6, 2022 at 3:39 PM

To: "=?UTF-8?Q?=22Alberta_Rika_Pratiwi=22?=" <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

Cc: The Authors <authors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>, The Editors <editors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

A new submission for Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development has been uploaded by "Widhi Handayani" <widhyandayani@gmail.com>.

The authors are:

"Widhi Handayani" <widhyandayani@gmail.com>

"Yohanes Budi Widianarko" <widianarko@unika.ac.id>

"Alberta Rika Pratiwi" <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

The title is:

"SYNTHETIC DYES AND NATURAL DYES IN COMPARISON: ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECOFRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK PRODUCTION BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH"

The keywords are:

batik, eco-friendliness, natural dyes, small-medium enterprise, synthetic dyes, water footprint

The disciplines are:

Environmental Studies | Life Sciences | Social and Behavioral Sciences

The submission has been assigned #1185. Please refer to this number in any correspondence related to the submission.

Authors may check the status of the submission, submit revisions, and contact editors via the following link:

<https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/cgi/preview.cgi?article=1185&context=jessd>

Editors can access the management tools for this submission at:

<https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/cgi/editor.cgi?article=1185&context=jessd>

Thank you,

The Editors

Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development



Rika Pratiwi <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

Manuscript 1185-Request to Revised Article Round 2- Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development

1 message

JESSD UI <jessd@ui.ac.id>

Wed, May 17, 2023 at 6:38 PM

To: Widhi Handayani <widhyandayani@gmail.com>, pratiwi@unika.ac.id, widianarko@unika.ac.id

Cc: jessd.sil.ui@gmail.com

Dear Widhi Handayani; Yohanes Budi Widianarko; Alberta Rika Pratiwi

Wish you all the best and good health.

We appreciate your decision to submit your excellent work to JESSD.

We would like to inform you that your article with the title **“SYNTHETIC DYES AND NATURAL DYES IN COMPARISON: ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECOFRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK PRODUCTION BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH”** needs to be revised based on Editor notes (Round 2).

Please revise it **manually by replying to this email within 7 days maximum** after you received this email. Because we still have more processes to send back to the reviewers, proofread, and galley proof. And we attached the list of revision templates (File Attached), so please write your revision in this form and mark it with **the red colour** of your revision. So the reviewers can track your revision.

We will submit the business process regarding this to the journal system. Please ignore it if you have received any notifications from the journal system.

Thank you for your cooperation

Best Regards,


Editor in Chief

--

Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development
School of Environmental Science
Universitas Indonesia

2 attachments

 **1185_Batik_Water_Footprint_06122022_revised (1)(3).docx**
2391K

 **template_revision_list_jessd (1).doc**
451K



Rika Pratiwi <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

Manuscript 1185-Request to Revised Article Round 3- Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development

2 messages

JESSD UI <jessd@ui.ac.id>

Thu, May 25, 2023 at 11:35 AM

To: Widhi Handayani <widhyandayani@gmail.com>, pratiwi@unika.ac.id, widianarko@unika.ac.id

Cc: jessd.sil.ui@gmail.com

Dear Widhi Handayani; Yohanes Budi Widianarko; Alberta Rika Pratiwi

Wish you all the best and good health.

We appreciate your decision to submit your excellent work to JESSD.

We would like to inform you that your article with the title **“SYNTHETIC DYES AND NATURAL DYES IN COMPARISON: ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECOFRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK PRODUCTION BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH”** needs to be revised based on Editor notes (Round 3).

Please revise it **manually by replying to this email within 7 days maximum** after you received this email. Because we still have more processes to send back to the reviewers, proofread, and galley proof. And we attached the list of revision templates (File Attached), so please write your revision in this form and mark it with **the red colour** of your revision. So the reviewers can track your revision.

We will submit the business process regarding this to the journal system. Please ignore it if you have received any notifications from the journal system.

Thank you for your cooperation

Best Regards,


Editor in Chief

--

Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development
School of Environmental Science
Universitas Indonesia

3 attachments

 **1185_Review form.doc**
334K

 **1185_Batik_Water_Footprint_06122022_revised 2nd round.docx**
2397K

 **template_revision_list_jessd (1).doc**
451K

Widhi Handayani <widhyandayani@gmail.com>

To: JESSD UI <jessd@ui.ac.id>

Cc: pratiwi@unika.ac.id, widianarko@unika.ac.id, jessd.sil.ui@gmail.com

Wed, May 31, 2023 at 6:18 PM

Dear JESSD Editor,


please find the attached revised manuscript as requested. Please also check our comments regarding the references. Thank you.

Kind regards,
Widhi Handayani

[Quoted text hidden]

2 attachments

 **template_revision_jessd_1185_round3.doc**
345K

 **1185_Batik_Water_Footprint_06122022_revised 3rd round.docx**
2407K



Rika Pratiwi <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

MS #1185: Update submitted for "ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECO-FRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH"

1 message

Editors of Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development <editors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

Wed, Jul 26, 2023 at 10:44 AM

To: =?UTF-8?Q?=22Alberta_Rika_Pratiwi=22?= <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

Cc: The Authors <authors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>, Assigned Editor <editor-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

This is an automatically-generated note to inform you that "JESSD UI" <jessd@ui.ac.id> has submitted an update to MS #1185, "ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECO-FRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH," in Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development.

The reason for update is:

No reason provided

The changes made are:

The title has changed. The old title was:

SYNTHETIC DYES AND NATURAL DYES IN COMPARISON: ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECOFRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK PRODUCTION BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH

The authors are:

"Widhi Handayani" <widhyandayani@gmail.com>

"Yohanes Budi Widianarko" <widianarko@unika.ac.id>

"Alberta Rika Pratiwi" <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

A preview of the title page and status may be viewed at:

<https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/cgi/preview.cgi?article=1185&context=jessd>

Editors can access the tools to manage this submission at:

<https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/cgi/editor.cgi?article=1185&context=jessd>

Thank you,

The Editors

Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development



Rika Pratiwi <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

MS #1185: Update submitted for "ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECO-FRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH"

1 message

Editors of Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development <editors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

Wed, Jul 26, 2023 at 10:44 AM

To: =?UTF-8?Q?=22Alberta_Rika_Pratiwi=22?= <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

Cc: The Authors <authors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>, Assigned Editor <editor-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

This is an automatically-generated note to inform you that "JESSD UI" <jessd@ui.ac.id> has submitted an update to MS #1185, "ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECO-FRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH," in Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development.

The reason for update is:

No reason provided

The changes made are:

The title has changed. The old title was:

SYNTHETIC DYES AND NATURAL DYES IN COMPARISON: ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECOFRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK PRODUCTION BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH

The authors are:

"Widhi Handayani" <widhyandayani@gmail.com>

"Yohanes Budi Widianarko" <widianarko@unika.ac.id>

"Alberta Rika Pratiwi" <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

A preview of the title page and status may be viewed at:

<https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/cgi/preview.cgi?article=1185&context=jessd>

Editors can access the tools to manage this submission at:

<https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/cgi/editor.cgi?article=1185&context=jessd>

Thank you,

The Editors

Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development



Rika Pratiwi <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

MS #1185: New submission published to Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development

1 message

Editors of Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development <editors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

Mon, Jul 31, 2023 at 10:11 AM

To: Widhi Handayani <widhyandayani@gmail.com>, Yohanes Budi Widianarko <widianarko@unika.ac.id>, Alberta Rika Pratiwi <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

Cc: The Editors <editors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

Dear Widhi Handayani, Yohanes Budi Widianarko, and Alberta Rika Pratiwi,

Your submission "ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECO-FRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH" (MS #1185) has been published to Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development.

<https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/jessd/vol6/iss1/9>

Want to maximize readership? Improve the Google rank of your submission by putting its title, formatted as a link, on your personal or departmental webpage at your institution.

Thank you,

The Editors

Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development



Rika Pratiwi <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

Re: MS #1185: New submission published to Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development

4 messages

Widhi Handayani <widhyandayani@gmail.com>

Mon, Jul 31, 2023 at 10:40 AM

To: Editors of Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development <editors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

Cc: BUDI WIDIANARKO <widianarko@unika.ac.id>, Rika Pratiwi <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

Dear Editor,

Thank you for your information. However, we would like to apologize that the affiliation of Dr Alberta Rika Pratiwi was mistakenly written. The affiliation should be Universitas Katolik Soegijapranata. We have inform this via email on May 23, 2023 (please check the attached screenshot of the email). Once again, thank you for your help.

Kind regards,
Widhi Handayani

On Mon, Jul 31, 2023, 10:11 Editors of Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development <editors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com> wrote:

Dear Widhi Handayani, Yohanes Budi Widianarko, and Alberta Rika Pratiwi,

Your submission "ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECO-FRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH" (MS #1185) has been published to Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development.

<https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/jessd/vol6/iss1/9>

Want to maximize readership? Improve the Google rank of your submission by putting its title, formatted as a link, on your personal or departmental webpage at your institution.

Thank you,

The Editors

Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development

Widhi Handayani <widhyandayani@gmail.com>

Mon, Jul 31, 2023 at 11:16 AM

To: JESSD SIL Universitas Indonesia <jessd@ui.ac.id>, jessd.sil.ui@gmail.com, JESSD UI <editor-jessd-1185-3169797@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

Cc: Rika Pratiwi <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>, BUDI WIDIANARKO <widianarko@unika.ac.id>

Dear Editor,

Thank you for your information. However, we would like to apologize that the affiliation of Dr Alberta Rika Pratiwi was mistakenly written. The affiliation should be Universitas Katolik Soegijapranata. We have informed this via email on May 23, 2023 (please check the attached screenshot of the email). Once again, thank you for your help.

[Quoted text hidden]



Screenshot_2023-07-31-10-36-17-53.png
316K

Rika Pratiwi <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>
To: Widhi Handayani <widhyandayani@gmail.com>

Mon, Jul 31, 2023 at 11:22 AM

terima kasih bu Widhi. semoga selalu sehat.

rika

[Quoted text hidden]

Widhi Handayani <widhyandayani@gmail.com>
To: Rika Pratiwi <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

Mon, Jul 31, 2023 at 11:24 AM

Sama-sama Bu Rika. Puji Tuhan, saya sehat Bu.

Salam,
Widhi Handayani

[Quoted text hidden]



Rika Pratiwi <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

MS #1185: Update submitted for "ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECO-FRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH"

3 messages

Editors of Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development <editors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

Mon, Jul 31, 2023 at 10:37 AM

To: "Alberta Rika Pratiwi" <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

Cc: The Authors <authors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>, Assigned Editor <editor-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

This is an automatically-generated note to inform you that "JESSD UI" <jessd@ui.ac.id> has submitted an update to MS #1185, "ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECO-FRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH," in Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development.

The reason for update is:

Publication July 2023

The changes made are:

The authors are:

"Widhi Handayani" <widhyandayani@gmail.com>

"Yohanes Budi Widianarko" <widianarko@unika.ac.id>

"Alberta Rika Pratiwi" <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

A preview of the title page and status may be viewed at:

<https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/cgi/preview.cgi?article=1185&context=jessd>

Editors can access the tools to manage this submission at:

<https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/cgi/editor.cgi?article=1185&context=jessd>

Thank you,

The Editors

Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development

Editors of Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development <editors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

Mon, Jul 31, 2023 at 12:28 PM

To: "\"Alberta Rika Pratiwi\"" <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

Cc: The Authors <authors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>, Assigned Editor <editor-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

This is an automatically-generated note to inform you that "JESSD UI" <jessd@ui.ac.id> has submitted an update to MS #1185, "ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECO-FRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH," in Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development.

The reason for update is:

No reason provided

[Quoted text hidden]

Editors of Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development <editors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

Mon, Jul 31, 2023 at 12:31 PM

To: "\"Alberta Rika Pratiwi\"" <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

Cc: The Authors <authors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>, Assigned Editor <editor-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

[Quoted text hidden]



Rika Pratiwi <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

MS #1185: Update submitted for "ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECO-FRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH"

1 message

Editors of Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development <editors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

Wed, Aug 2, 2023 at 9:41 AM

To: "Alberta Rika Pratiwi" <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

Cc: The Authors <authors-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>, Assigned Editor <editor-jessd-1185@dcuischolarhub.bepress.com>

This is an automatically-generated note to inform you that "JESSD UI" <jessd@ui.ac.id> has submitted an update to MS #1185, "ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECO-FRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH," in Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development.

The reason for update is:

Publication July 2023

The changes made are:

The authors are:

"Widhi Handayani" <widhyandayani@gmail.com>

"Yohanes Budi Widianarko" <widianarko@unika.ac.id>

"Alberta Rika Pratiwi" <pratiwi@unika.ac.id>

A preview of the title page and status may be viewed at:

<https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/cgi/preview.cgi?article=1185&context=jessd>

Editors can access the tools to manage this submission at:

<https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/cgi/editor.cgi?article=1185&context=jessd>

Thank you,

The Editors

Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development

RESPONSE TO REVIEWER

Dear reviewer of JESSD journal, we would like to thank for your comments for our manuscript entitled “SYNTHETIC DYES AND NATURAL DYES IN COMPARISON: ADDRESSING THE DEBATE ON THE ECOFRIENDLINESS OF INDONESIAN BATIK PRODUCTION BY WATER FOOTPRINT APPROACH.” Please kindly check our response to your comments and a revised version of our manuscript in red font color.

Kind regards,

Authors

NO.	COMMENTS	RESPONSE
1.	<p>Dear Author, before we begin, please make sure that you read the Author Guidelines on our website: https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/jessd/styleguide.html</p> <p>a. Original Research Article (5000-8000 words, excluding references) is A full length original empirical research, mainly following this order: introduction, methods, results and discussion, conclusions, and references, an accurate description of research and an objective and comprehensive discussion of the results are highly encouraged.</p> <p>b. Number of references should be more than 30 references which published within last 3-5 years.</p>	<p>1. Thank you for your comment that remind us to check our manuscript. We have checked the manuscript and found the manuscript consists of around 5696 words including Table; while the Abstract, Acknowledgement, Author Contribution, and References were excluded from the word count.</p> <p>2. Thank you for your comment. We tried to replace some out of date articles by the newer ones. However, there are some sources which are quite important and not yet can be replaced, such as the writings of Hoekstra et al (2011) on The Water Footprint Assessment Manual as the basis of methodology of this research; the Indonesian government regulation on standard of wastewater parameter discharged by industries; etc. The literature of Thomas Stamford Raffles which was used from its original book published in 1817 was replaced by its translated version published by Penerbit Narasi in 2019.</p> <p>Previously, the total references were 37. We then replaced 9 of them by 9 updated articles, therefore the final total references were 37 and it is still meet the expectation of the journal.</p>
2.	<p>a. We recommend you to make the abstract in order:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Background (1-2 sentences) • Aims and objectives (1-3 sentences) • Method (1-3 sentences) • Contribution for future research (optional 1 sentence) <p>b. An abstract is often presented separately from the article, so it must be able to stand-alone. For this reason, References should be avoided. Also, non-standard or uncommon abbreviations should be avoided, but if essential they must be defined at their first mention in the abstract itself.</p>	<p>Thank you. We have revised the abstract as suggested. Please check the revision below (indicated in the manuscript by red font color):</p> <p>1. Background: “The Indonesian batik is an Intangible Cultural Heritage which contributes to the economics of the country, but rises environmental pollution. Synthetic dyes are considered to be the cause of the pollution and the natural counterpart is recommended to replace it because natural dyes are considered to be more eco-friendly than the synthetic ones.”</p> <p>2. Gap and aim: “Although studies on batik water footprint related to dyeing process have been conducted previously, they are quite limited. Therefore, this study examined the Blue Water Footprint (BWF) and Grey Water Footprint (GWF) of a batik household industry applying synthetic dyeing</p>

		<p>and compare the result to the natural dyeing from previous studies.”</p> <p>3. Method: “This research used Water Footprint accounting approach based on Water Footprint Network which involves the identification of batik process followed by measuring and calculating the consumptive water use representing BWF and degradative water use representing GWF”</p> <p>4. Results: “The BWF of batik-making process applying of synthetic dyes was 1000.914 L/day or 9.223 L/pc, and the GWF was 12,877.215 – 18,003.118 L/day or 95.39 – 142.88 L/pc. Washing consumes water at most and is responsible for the high BWF, while dilution water for dye solution and wastewater are the dominant to the portion of GWF. The application of both dyes produces wastewater which quality exceeds the acceptable limit set by Indonesian government, indicating that concept of eco-friendliness should not directly be associated to the use of synthetic or natural dyes. Selection of synthetic dyes or natural dyes alone for batik production is not recommended, since dyeing might not only be related to environmental issue, but also to market preferences. The main problem lies in general assumption of the batik artisans in regard to eco-friendliness linked to specific dyes which needs to be improved by increasing of water use efficiency by the support of technology.”</p> <p>5. Contribution: Future research requires to focus on finding innovation to reduce the water use in batik processing.</p>
<p>3.</p>	<p>We recommend that you split this paragraph into two paragraphs. We found 2 main ideas in this paragraph: 1. benefit of batik; 2. challenges of batik.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments. We have split the paragraph into two as suggested:</p> <p>“Indonesian batik fabrics have been produced for hundred years and recognized as Intangible Cultural Heritage by the UNESCO in 2009. This recognition brings advantages in the economic aspect as batik production provides employment to job seekers, as well as increases the national income. Often, batik fabric is produced by small and medium enterprises (SMEs) spread in the regions of Solo, Pekalongan, Tegal, Lasem, and Banyumas (Mukimin <i>et al.</i>, 2018) as well as Klaten (Handayani <i>et al.</i>, 2018a).”</p> <p>“Batik produced by SMEs are usually managed by a relatively small family-based facilities with no wastewater treatment units, and their various locations make it difficult to build a centralized treatment system (Birgani <i>et al.</i>, 2016). Consequently, the batik SMEs tend to discharge wastewater directly into channels or the soil in their surroundings, which eventually causes related pollution. The pollution is usually related to the use of dyes, as the batik involves dyeing in its process.</p>

		Generally, the synthetic dyes are considered as the main source of pollution.”
4.	Is it relevance enough to cite this references? if yes, can you find the newest reference to be cited in your article.	Thank you for your comment. As previously explained, we tried to replace some out of date articles by the newer ones. However, there are some sources which are quite important and not yet can be replaced, such as the writings of Hoekstra et al (2011) on The Water Footprint Assessment Manual as the research methodology was conducted based on this literature. The book of Fred Kruis (1995) was also used to conduct the measurement of chemical parameters, such as COD and BOD5, and hence, the literature should be included.
5.	Make the word style consistent	Thank you for your comment. We have revised the word style as suggested.