PAPER NAME

**AUTHOR** 

# The Effect of CSR Disclosure on The Value Relevance of Cash Based and Accrual Based Accounting Numbe

Linggar Yekti Nugraheni

**WORD COUNT** 

**CHARACTER COUNT** 

**3274 Words** 

18286 Characters

PAGE COUNT

**FILE SIZE** 

7 Pages

225.8KB

SUBMISSION DATE

REPORT DATE

Feb 5, 2024 6:45 AM GMT+7

Feb 5, 2024 6:46 AM GMT+7

## 17% Overall Similarity

The combined total of all matches, including overlapping sources, for each database.

11% Internet database

Crossref database

- internet database
- 14% Submitted Works database
- 10% Publications database
- Crossref Posted Content database

# Excluded from Similarity Report

- Bibliographic material
- · Cited material
- Manually excluded sources

- · Quoted material
- Small Matches (Less then 8 words)

# The effect of corporate social responsibility disclosure on the value relevance of cashbased and accrual-based accounting numbers

Empirical study on Indonesian Manufacturing Companies Listed in the IDX in 2007-2009 periods

#### B. Linggar Yekti Nugraheni

#### Yusni Warastuti

raculty of Economics and Business, Soegijapranata Catholic University
Jl. Pawiyatan Luhur IV/1 Semarang, Indonesia

linggarb@yahoo.com; warastutiyusni@yahoo.co.id

Abstract— **Integrated** reporting combined reporting which consist financial and non financial information. In this study, non financial information refers to the disclosure of corporate social responsibility This (CSR). investigates the value relevance of cashbased compared to accrual-based accounting numbers, and insert disclosure of social responsibility. We use the unexpected earnings to represent the accrual-based. Meanwhile, the cash-based is represented by unexpected cash from operating activities. We also use CSR variable index moderating value relevance strengthen accounting numbers. The samples used in this research are Indonesia manufaturing companies listed in IDX from 2007-2009. The expected result is companies will have higher value relevance of accounting numbers when the index of CSR is higher. Furthermore, this study is also conducted provide evidence that the value relevance of cash-based and accrual based accounting numbers will be different when we insert the CSR index. We use Adjusted R<sup>2</sup> to measure value relevance of accounting numbers.

*Keywords*—Value relevance, CSR index, cash-based, accrual-based,

#### I. INTRODUCTION

Value relevance could be explained as predicted association between accounting information and equity value. researches have been done regarding the value relevance of the accounting numbers. Hayn (1995), Amir and Lev (1996), Elliott and Hanna (1996), Basu, (1997) conducted researches to validate the value relevance of financial report while Collins et al., (1997); Graham et al., (1998), Francis and Schipper, (1999) and Lev and Zarowin (1999) focused on the evolution of value relevance. The result becomes a continuing debate regarding the trend of value relevance over the observed years

Financial reporting is now in an era of convergence. Traditionally, company anual primarily consists of financial information, i.e. balance sheet, the profit and account and the accompanying directors' report which outline company's performance. In the past decades, there was a shift in how companies report the impact they have on their stakeholders. By the end of the last century, big companies around the worldstarted to explain their impact on the environment and wider society in CSR (Corporate Social Responsibility) reports. Over the last decade CSR reporting has grown significantly, from 35 percent in 1999 to 80 percent of the companies listed in the Global Fortune 250

**1.0** inch

in 2008. Over the last years, a selected number of companies have started to integrate CSR reporting into the annual report. As of today, only 3 percent of the companies worldwide are reporting on an integrated basis, eventhough there was an increasing figure of this report.

Recent studies show that disclosure of social responsibility would increase firm value. This could be positive signal for investors to make any economic decisions. We propose that company with high level of CSR disclosure index would strengthen the value relevance of accounting numbers, wether the accounting numbers are accrual-based or cash-based.

#### II. PROBLEMS

This study addresses some questions whether:

- 1. Accrual-Based Accounting Numbers hve value relevance
- 2. Cash-based Accounting Numbers have value relevance
- 3. Higher CSR disclosure index would result higher value relevance.

# III. THE RESEARCH BJECTIVES

The objectives of this research are:

- 1. To provide evidence that accrual-based accounting has value relevance
- 2. To provide evidence that cash-based accounting has value relevance
- 3. To provide evidence that higher CSR disclosure index would result to higher value relevance.

#### III. LITERATURE REVIEW

Some researches related to CSR has been growing rapidly. Research conducted over the years on CSR. O'Dwyer (2002), Adams and McNicholas., (2007) conducted study of what motivates managers to make particular social reports. Another research is done by Belkaoui, (1976), whio tested of

how particular stakeholders react to social and environmental disclosures.

Belkaoui (1999) explores the relationship between CSR and Corporate Financial Performance (CFP). It is also done by other researcher such as Richardson et al., (1999) and Mahoney and Roberts (2007).

Researches on those particular topics also used event study methodology. The results of these studies are controversial, and sometimes researchers present a critical analysis of the use of this methodology to investigate CSR and (McWilliams and Siegel, 2000)

However, the purpose of this research is to investigate whether whether stock prices are influenced by the publication of a social report, and we consider value relevance to be the most suitable method of analysis for this purpose.

Value relevance is defined as the ability of financial statement information to capture and summaries firm value (Beaver, 1968). Some researches aimed to investigate an empirical association between the stock market values and accounting information. The models which capture this association are divided into two categories, i.e., price model and return model. Ohlson (1995) developed those models from the linear information model which has been used by various researchers over the years.

The concept of relevant value (an accounting value is also defined as value-relevant if it has a predicted association with equity market values) is not new in the literature (Miller and Modigliani,1966), use of the term "value-relevance" is relatively recent (Amir et al., 1993).

Collins et al., (1997) and (Barth et al., 1998) applied the value relevance to individual accounting variables while and Amir and Lev,(1996) and Xu et al., (2002) applied to non-financial variables.

Collins *et al.* (1997) investigated the change of value elevance of earnings and book value equity by using price model during 1953-1993 periods. They found that the value relevance of earnings and book

value equity increased slightly during the observaton periods

Ha1: Accrual-based and cash-based accounting numbers have value relevance

Some interesting applications of value relevance to non-financial variables are proposed by Sinkin et al. (2008). They examine the relationship between adoption of eco-efficient business strategies and firm value using the Ohlson model, modified to include an indicator variable for eco-efficiency. They found that the adoption of eco-efficient business strategies is positively related to firm value. The results of their analysis of 431 firms indicate that eco-efficient firms have consistently higher market values than non-eco-efficient firms.

Hassel et al. (2005) also propose applying value relevance to environmental performance. They use an accounting based valuation model developed by Ohlson in which the market value of equity is a function of book value, accounting earnings and environmental performance. Their results indicate a significant negative relationship between the market value of listed Swedish companies and their environmental performance.

Those briefly analysed studies provide some important points to consider in our research Analysis of earlier studies did not explore me effect of CSR index on the value relevance difference between accrual-based accounting number (unexpected earnings) and cash-based accounting number (uexpected cash flow from operation). In fact, to the best of our knowledge, no studies have investigated the effect of CSR disclosure index on the value relevance of those two kind accounting numbers

Ha2: Companies with higher CSR disclosure index would have higher value relevance of accounting numbers.

#### IV. RESEARCH METHOD

This study uses secondary data. Samples are generated by purposive sampling method.

This method requires some criterias which consist of:

- 1. Public manufacturing companies listed in the IDX during 2007-2009 periods.
- 2. The data of earnings announcement dates and other related data are available for four years time series.
- 3. The publication dates are no later than 90 days after the year end. Late publication is considered to be bias for research investigation.

Tabel 4.1. List of Sample

| Sample criterias                                      | 2007 | 2008 | 2009 | Total |
|---|------|------|------|-------|
| Manufacturing companies                               | 151  | 149  | 146  | 446   |
| Earnings<br>announcement<br>date are not<br>available | (2)  | (12) | (25) | (39)  |
| Earnings announcement date are late                   | (55) | (88) | (106 | (249) |
| Data are not available                                | (34) | (25) | (5)  | (64)  |
| Total   | 60   | 24   | 10   | 94    |

This study uses unexpected earnings as proxy of accrual-based accounting, derived from earnings in the current period substracted by earnings in prior year and divided by earnings in the prior year. Meanwhile, we use unexpected cash flow from operation (CFO) proxy of cash-based accounting, derived from CFO in the current period substracted by earnings in prior year and divided by CFO in the prior year. CSR disclosure would be measured by CSR index, by using 78 items of disclosure list (Hakston and Milne, 1996).

The research uses modified Ohlson model (1995) and formulated as follows:

$$CAR_{it} = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 UE_{it} + \epsilon_{it}$$

$$CAR_{it} = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 UCFO_{it} + \epsilon_{it}$$

Those models are then categorized into high CSR index and low CSR index to differensiate the effect of CSR on the value relevance of accrual-based and cash based accounting numbers.

#### V. DISCUSSION

#### The Hypothesis 1 Testing

This hypothesis 1 is aimed to test the value relevance of accrual-based accounting. Unexpected earnings is deployed as proxy of accrual-based accounting numbers.

Table. 5.1 Descriptive Statistic UE-CAR

| ·                     | Ν  | Min    | Max  | Mean    | Std. Dev |
|-----------------------|----|--------|------|---------|----------|
| UE                    | 27 | -88.03 | 7.55 | -3.0311 | 17.12073 |
| CAR                   | 27 | 03     | .08  | .0009   | .02384   |
| Valid N<br>(listwise) | 27 |        |      |         |          |

The table shows that mean for UE is -3.0311, which means curent year earnings are lower compared to prior year earnings. Mean value of CAR is 0.0009, which means that the stock price for today is higher compared to previous day.

For hypothesis testing, the table below shows that the value of R<sup>2</sup> is 0,398, more than 0, shows that accrual-based accounting numbers have value relevance. This research align with study conducted by Francis and Schipper (1999) Graham *et al.* (1998) and Collins *et al.* (1997) who found that earnings have value relevance.

Table 5.2 Hypothesis testing UE-CAR

|     |       | R     |              | Std. Error |         |
|-----|-------|-------|--------------|------------|---------|
| Mod |       | Squar | 8<br>djusted | of the     | Durbin- |
| el  | R     | е     | R Square     | Estimate   | Watson  |
| 1   | .649ª | .422  | .398         | .01849     | 1.702   |

a. Predictors: (Constant), UE

b. Dependent Variable: CAR

Further test is conducted to test the value relevance of cash-based accounting. Unexpected CFO is deployed as proxy of cash-based accounting numbers.

Table 5.2
Descriptive Statistic UCFO-CAR

|                       | N  | Min   | Max    | Mean   | Std.<br>Deviation |
|-----------------------|----|-------|--------|--------|-------------------|
| UCFO                  | 30 | -2.76 | 116.90 | 4.0514 | 21.34616          |
| CAR                   | 30 | 16    | .04    | 0030   | .03655            |
| Valid N<br>(listwise) | 30 |       |        |        |                   |

The table shows that mean for UCFO is 4.0514, which means curent year earnings are higher compared to prior year earnings. Mean value of CAR is -0.0030, which means that the stock price for today is lower compared to previous day

Table 5.3 Hypothesis Testing UCFO-CAR

|   |        |      | • •      |            |                         |         |
|---|--------|------|----------|------------|-------------------------|---------|
|   |        |      |          | Adjusted R | Std.<br>Error of<br>the | Durbin- |
| ١ | √lodel | R    | R Square | Square     | Estimate                | Watson  |
|   | 1      | .827 | .684     | .673       | .02091                  | 1.926   |

a. Predictors: (Constant), CCFO

b. Dependent Variable: CAR

The value of R<sup>2</sup> is 0.673, more than 0, shows that cash-based accounting numbers have value relevance

This result align with study conducted by Cheng et. Al (1996) who found that cash flow from operation has value relevance, even higher compared to value relevance of earnings. This could be understood as cash flow from operation activities, as proxy of cash-based accounting provide information of cash position that is generated from major operation of companies. Earnings, as proxy of accrual-based accounting, would not show the real cash position of the company.

#### **The Hypothesis 3 Testing**

This hypothesis test whether the CSR index influence value relevance.

Tabel 5.4. Hypothesis 3 Testing UE-CAR CSR low

|       |                 | nstandardized<br>Coefficients |                             | Standardized Coefficients |       |      |
|-------|-----------------|-------------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|-------|------|
| N     | /lodel          | В                             | Std.<br>Error               | Beta                      | T     | Sig. |
| 1     | (Cnstnt)        | .000                          | .017                        |                           | .012  | .991 |
|       | UE_CS<br>R High | .023                          | .009                        | .467                      | 2.585 | .016 |
| R     | R<br>Square     | Adj R Sq                      | Std.<br>Error of<br>the Est | Durbin-Watson             | F     | Sig. |
| .467ª | .218            | .185                          | .086311<br>9                | 1.945                     | 6.680 | .016 |

a. Dependent Variable: CAR CSRhigh

Table 5.5
Hypothesis 3 Testing UE-CAR SR

|      |               | Unstandardized<br>Coefficients |            | Standardized<br>Coefficients |       |      |
|------|---------------|--------------------------------|------------|------------------------------|-------|------|
| Mode | I             | В                              | Std. Error | Beta                         | t     | Sig. |
| 1    | (Constant)    | .006                           | .009       |                              | .699  | .488 |
|      | UE_CSR<br>low | .015                           | .006       | .374                         | 2.648 | .011 |
|      |               |                                | Std. Error | Durbin-                      |       |      |
| 5    | R Square      | Adj <mark>R</mark> Sq          | of the Est | Watson                       | F     | Sig. |
| .374 | .140          | .120                           | .0593423   | 2.043                        | 7.010 | .011 |

a. Dependent Variable: CAR\_CSRlow high

The tables show that higher CSR index would result higher value relevance of accrual-based accounting numbers. It could be seen in the value of adjusted R<sup>2</sup> for high CSR index (0.185) is higher compared to adjusted R<sup>2</sup> for low CSR index (0.12). This means that there is association between CSR information and equity value, i.e. cumulative abnormal return. This finding provide evidence that

CSR information strengthen the association between company performance and equity value. This finding is also supported by positive association between unexpected earnings and CAR (0.23) which is significant in the  $\alpha$  of 5% (0.16). This result support studies conducted by Sinkin *et.al.* (2008) aho found that the adoption of eco-efficient business strategies is positively related to firm value.

To support this finding, this research also test the effect of CSR index towards value relevance of cash-based accounting number.

Tabel 5.5 Hypothesis 3 Testing UCFO-CAR CSRhigh

|   |      | <i>J</i> 1       |                          | 8                      |                              |      |      |  |  |
|---|------|------------------|--------------------------|------------------------|------------------------------|------|------|--|--|
|   |      |                  | -                        | ndardized<br>fficients | Standardized<br>Coefficients |      |      |  |  |
| Ę | ode  | I                | В                        | Std. Error             | Beta                         | t    | Sig. |  |  |
|   | 1    | (Cnstnt)         | .005                     | .021                   |                              | .254 | .801 |  |  |
|   |      | UCFO_<br>CSRhigh | 001                      | .008                   | 038                          | 191  | .850 |  |  |
|   | 5    | R<br>Square      | Adj <mark>R</mark><br>Sq | Std. Error of the Est  | Durbin-Watson                | F    | Sig. |  |  |
|   | .038 | .001             | 038                      | .0958790               | 2.161                        | .036 | .850 |  |  |

a. Dependent Variable: CAR CSRhigh

Table 5.6 Hypothesis 3 Testing UCFO-CAR CSRlow

|       |                 |             | ndardized<br>fficients      | Standardized<br>Coefficients |       |       |
|-------|-----------------|-------------|-----------------------------|------------------------------|-------|-------|
| Mode  | el              | В           | Std.<br>Error               | Beta                         | t     | Sig.  |
| 1     | (Cnstnt)        | .002        | .006                        |                              | .378  | .708  |
|       | UCFO_C<br>SRlow | .003        | .003                        | .189                         | 1.172 | .249  |
| R     | R Square        | Adj R<br>Sq | Std.<br>Error of<br>the Est | Durbin-<br>Watson            | F     | Sig.  |
| .189ª | .036            | .010        | .0384118                    | 1.564                        | 1.374 | .249ª |

a. Dependent Variable: CAR CSRlow

Surprisingly, for cash-based accounting numbers, higher CSR have no value

relevance. It can be seen on the table 5.5 which shows the negative value of adjusted R2 (-0.038). By contrast, in the event of low CSR, cash-based accounting numbers have value relevance, eventhough the value of adjusted R is relatively low (0.010). This result does not support the hypothesis that higher CSR index would strengthen the value relevance of accounting numbers, i.e. cash-based accounting numbers.

There are some reasons to support those findings. Firstly, investors ni Indonesia still rely on earnings to support their decision making compared to other accounting numbers such as book value of equity and cash flow, included information of cash flow from operation. This could not be argued, as earnings contain potential revenues and expenses, eventhough cash realization would not happen in the curent period. Secondly, investors in Indonesia believe that CSR disclosure could strengthen the value relevance of earnings compared to the value relevance of cashflow from operation. Information of potential revenues combined with CSR disclosure are believed as a set of important information which provide two important informatin: pontential revenues and social responsibility activities. could be understood since cashflo from operating activities only capture cash inflow and cash outflow from company's major activities.

#### VI. CONCLUSIONS

This study could provide evidence that accounting numbers have value relevance. Both of accrual-based and cash-based accounting numbers have value relevance, where accrual-based accounting numbers show lower value relevance.

This research could also provide evidence that CSR disclosure index could strengthen the value relevance of accrual-based accounting. By contrast, this study fails to provide evidence that CSR disclosure index would strengthen the value relevance of cash-based accounting numbers. For the

future studies, we suggets to insert earnings attributes such as persistence or conservatism, to provide additional evidences related to value relevance of earnings, or to explain why accrual-based could have higher value relevance when we insert CSR disclosure index.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] Hayn, C. 1995. "The Information Content of Losses". Journal Accounting and Ecconomics 20, hal 125—153.
- [2] Amir E. and B. Lev (1996), 'Value-relevance of nonfinancial information: The Wireless communications industry', Journal of Accounting and Economics, Vol.22, Nos.1&3 (August-December), pp.3-30
- [3] Elliot, J. A., & Hanna, J. D. (1996). Repeated accounting write-offs and the information content of earnings. Journal of Accounting Research, 34(3), 135-155.
- [4] Basu, S. 1997. "The Conservatism Principle and The Asymetric Timeliness of Earnings". Journal of Accounting and Ecconomic 24, hal. 3—37.
- [5] Collins, D. W., Maydew, E. L., & Weiss, I. S. (1997). Changes in the value-relevance of earnings and book values over the past forty years. Journal of Accounting & Economics, 24(1), 39.
- [6] Graham, C. M., Cannice, M. V., & Sayre, T. L. (2002). The value-relevance of financial and non-financial information for internet companies. Thunderbird International Business Review, 44(1), 47-70.
- [7] Francis, J. and K. Schipper, (1999). "Have Financial Statements Lost Their Relevance." Journal of Accounting Research, 37, 319-352.
- [8] Lev, B., & Zarowin, P. (1999). The boundaries of financial reporting and how to extend them. Journal of Accounting Research, 37(2), 353-385.
- [9] O'Dwyer D. (2002), 'Managerial perceptions of corporate social disclosure', Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal, Vol.15, No.3 (Special Issue), pp.406-436
- [10] Chairil Adams C.A. and P. MNicholas ( (2007), 'Making a difference. Sustainability reporting,

- accountability and organizational change', Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal, Vol.20, No.3 (Special Issue), pp.382-402.
- [11] Belkaoui A. (1976), 'The impact of the disclosure of the environmental effects of organizational behavior on the market, Financial Management, Vol.5, No.4 (Winter), pp.26-31.
- [12] Belkaoui A.R. (1999), Corporate Social Awareness and Financial Outcomes, (Westport, CT: Greenwood Publishing Group).
- [13] Richardson A.J., M. Welker and I.R. Hutchinson (1999), 'Managing capital market reactions to corporate social responsibility', international Journal of Management Reviews, Vol.1, No.1 (March), pp.17-43.
- [14] Mahoney L. and R.W. Roberts (2007), 'Corporate social performance, financial performance and institutional ownership in Canadian firms', Accounting Forum, Vol.31, No.3 (September), pp.233-253.
- [15] Beaver, S. 1968. "Value-Relevance of Annual Earnings Announcements". *Journal of Accounting Research (Supplement)*, hal. 67—76.
- [16] Ohlson, J. 1995. "Earnings, Book Values, and Devidens in Security Valuation". Contemporary Accounting Research (Spring 1995), hal. 661—688.
- [17] Miller M.H. and F. Modigliani (1966), 'Some estimates of the cost of capital to the electric utility industry, 1954-57', The American Economic Review, Vol.56, No.3 (June), pp.333-391.
- [18] Barth, M. E., Beaver, W. H., & Landsman, W. R. (1998). Relative valuation roles of equity book value and net income as a function of financial health. Journal of Accounting & Economics, 25(1), 1-34.
- [19] Xu, B. (2002). The value relevance of non-financial performance information in biotechnology firms. (Doctoral Dissertation, Concordia University).
- [20] Sinkin C.J., Wright and R.D. Burnet(2008), 'Layoff announcements and stockholder wealth', Journal of Accounting and Public Policy, Vol.27, No.2 (march-April), pp.167-176
- [21] Hassel., H. Nilson and S. Nyquist (2005), 'The Value Relevance of Environmental Performance', European Accounting Review, Vol.14, No.1 (May), p.41-61.
- [22] Hakston D., and Milne A.J (1996). "Some determinants of social and environmental disclosures

- in New Zealand companies ", Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal, Vol. 9 No. 1, 1996, pp. 77-108. © MCB University Press, 0951-3574
- [23] Cheng, A., C. Liu, dan T. Schaefer. 1996. "Earnings Performance and The Incremental Information Content of Cash Flows from Operation". Journal of Accounting Research (Spring), hal. 173—181.

### 17% Overall Similarity

Top sources found in the following databases:

- 11% Internet database
- Crossref database
- 14% Submitted Works database
- 10% Publications database
- Crossref Posted Content database

#### **TOP SOURCES**

The sources with the highest number of matches within the submission. Overlapping sources will not be displayed.

| 1 | Universiti Putra Malaysia on 2011-02-15 Submitted works     | <1% |
|---|---|-----|
| 2 | eprints.qut.edu.au<br>Internet                              | <1% |
| 3 | repository.trisakti.ac.id Internet                          | <1% |
| 4 | University of Paisley on 2012-12-05 Submitted works         | <1% |
| 5 | repository.futminna.edu.ng:8080 Internet                    | <1% |
| 6 | Grand Valley State University on 2010-04-19 Submitted works | <1% |
| 7 | tandfonline.com<br>Internet                                 | <1% |
| 8 | oer.unn.edu.ng<br>Internet                                  | <1% |

| 9  | media.neliti.com<br>Internet  | <1% |
|----|---|-----|
| 10 | journal.unika.ac.id<br>Internet   | <1% |
| 11 | 9pdf.net<br>Internet  | <1% |
| 12 | Ervin Black. "Usefulness of financial statement components in valuatio  Crossref  | <1% |
| 13 | University of Greenwich on 2015-01-26 Submitted works                             | <1% |
| 14 | binaniindustries.com<br>Internet  | <1% |
| 15 | Giuma Kraid, Osama Hadi. "Factors Affecting Job Motivation, Job Satis Publication | <1% |
| 16 | University of Southampton on 2022-09-15 Submitted works                           | <1% |
| 17 | businessperspectives.org Internet   | <1% |
| 18 | virtusinterpress.org<br>Internet  | <1% |
| 19 | Central Queensland University on 2012-04-02 Submitted works                       | <1% |
| 20 | Frédérique Déjean, Isabelle Martinez. "Environmental Disclosure and th  Crossref  | <1% |

| King's College on 2012-10-23<br>Submitted works                                  | <1% |
|--|-----|
| Waikato University on 2006-06-16 Submitted works                                 | <1% |
| es.scribd.com<br>Internet  | <1% |
| Chelsea Liu, Graeme Gould, Barry Burgan. "Value-relevance of financial  Crossref | <1% |
| Journal of Accounting in Emerging Economies, Volume 2, Issue 2 (201 Publication  | <1% |
| London School of Business and Finance on 2011-04-18 Submitted works              | <1% |
| Open University of Mauritius on 2020-08-09 Submitted works                       | <1% |
| Papadatos, Konstantinos, and Vasiliki Makri. "The value relevance of e  Crossref | <1% |
| Swinburne University of Technology on 2023-03-07 Submitted works                 | <1% |
| University of Bristol on 2012-09-10 Submitted works                              | <1% |
| University of Stirling on 2011-08-22 Submitted works                             | <1% |
| University of Sussex on 2011-06-09 Submitted works                               | <1% |
|  |     |

| 33 | archive.org Internet                    | <1% |
|----|---|-----|
| 34 | brage.bibsys.no<br>Internet             | <1% |
| 35 | rjopes.emergingresource.org<br>Internet | <1% |
| 36 | ohiolink.edu<br>Internet                | <1% |
| 37 | tecnia.in Internet                      | <1% |

# Excluded from Similarity Report

- Bibliographic material
- Cited material
- Manually excluded sources

- Quoted material
- Small Matches (Less then 8 words)

#### **EXCLUDED SOURCES**

| repository.unika.ac.id Internet | 11% |
|---------------------------------|-----|
| journalmabis.org<br>Internet    | 10% |
| efmaefm.org<br>Internet         | 6%  |
| docplayer.net<br>Internet       | 6%  |
| scribd.com<br>Internet          | 6%  |
| researchgate.net Internet       | 6%  |
| mafiadoc.com<br>Internet        | 6%  |
| emeraldinsight.com<br>Internet  | 5%  |
| sustainabilitysa.org            | 5%  |

| kpmg.com<br>Internet  | 5% |
|---|----|
| iodsa.co.za<br>Internet   | 5% |
| in.kpmg.com<br>Internet   | 5% |
| cdn.ymaws.com<br>Internet   | 5% |
| onlinelibrary.wiley.com<br>Internet   | 5% |
| studymode.com<br>Internet   | 4% |
| fbe.ubaya.ac.id Internet  | 4% |
| Concetta Carnevale, Maria Mazzuca, Sergio Venturini. "Corporate Social Repo  Crossref | 4% |
| Concetta Carnevale, Maria Mazzuca, Sergio Venturini. "Corporate Social Repo  Crossref | 4% |
| Paola Cardamone, Concetta Carnevale, Francesco Giunta. "The value relevanc  Crossref  | 3% |
| Journal of Applied Accounting Research, Volume 13, Issue 3 (2012-11-24) Publication   | 3% |
| Higher Education Commission Pakistan on 2013-09-08 Submitted works                    | 3% |

| Higher Education Commission Pakistan on 2013-09-08 Submitted works                 | 3% |
|--|----|
| rierc.org<br>Internet  | 3% |
| Universitas Terbuka on 2015-07-07 Submitted works                                  | 3% |
| agir.academiascience.org  Internet   | 3% |
| University of Leicester on 2012-05-09 Submitted works                              | 2% |
| "Advances in Cross-Section Data Methods in Applied Economic Research", Sp Crossref | 2% |
| isea.icseard.uns.ac.id Internet  | 2% |
| Hong Kong Baptist University on 2012-04-29 Submitted works                         | 2% |
| University of Cape Town on 2011-07-05 Submitted works                              | 2% |
| riviste.paviauniversitypress.it  | 1% |